

**UNDISCLOSED, the State v. Pamela Lanier**  
**Episode 3 - Eliminate the Impossible**  
**May 7, 2018**

**[0:22] Colin Miller:** It's one of Sherlock Holmes's most famous maxims, repeated here by a kid on the Hungry Earth episode of "Dr. Who" after a body goes missing from a grave:

**Clip from *Dr. Who*:**

**Elliot:**

There's only one explanation, as far as I can see.

**Rory:**

What's that, then?

**Elliot:**

The graves eat people. Devour them whole, leaving no trace.

**Rory:**

Not sure about that.

**Elliot:**

They didn't steal the body from above. They couldn't have gotten in from the sides. Only other thing is, they get in from underneath.

**Rory:**

Not very likely, though.

**Elliot:**

When you've eliminated the impossible, whatever remains, however improbable, must be the truth.

**Colin Miller:** But while this maxim has been repeated, not just on "Dr. Who" but also on "The X-Files," "Star Trek," and in courtrooms across the country, it has also been criticized as the "Holmesian fallacy." And that's because we're generally pretty terrible about ruling out all other possibilities before arriving at our final verdict.

Think a mother being convicted of her daughter's death based on a doctor's diagnosis of Shaken Baby Syndrome only to find out years later that the child had a bleeding disorder. Or a man convicted of arson based on crazed glass in his home only to find out decades later that the crazed glass was caused by the water from the firefighters' hoses and not an accelerant used by the man.

With regard to the death of Dorian Lanier, there was no direct evidence that Pam Lanier murdered her husband and no obvious source of the arsenic that caused his death. And yet, Dorian died from both chronic and acute arsenic poisoning, and Pam was his primary caretaker in the two months leading up to his death. And so, when the State eliminated the impossible, it was left with the one result that, no matter how improbable, must have been the truth: Pam had taken the life of her husband.

**[1:53] Rabia Chaudry:** Hi, and welcome to Undisclosed: The State V. Pam Lanier. This is the third in a series of 4 episodes on the case of Pam Lanier, who was convicted of the 1997 murder of her husband Dorian, in Chinquapin, North Carolina. My name is Rabia Chaudry. I'm an attorney, and author of Adnan's Story, and as always, I'm here with my colleagues Susan Simpson and Colin Miller.

**Susan Simpson:** I'm Susan Simpson, I'm an attorney with the Volkov Law Group, and I blog at ViewFromLL2.com.

**Colin Miller:** I'm Colin Miller, I'm Associate Dean and Professor at The University of South Carolina School of Law, and I blog @EvidenceProfBlog.

**Rabia Chaudry:** In September 1997, Dorian and Pam Lanier had a successful turkey farming business, taking home about \$20,000 every few months, under a contract with Nash Johnson & Sons. At the time, Dorian was 56 years old and Pam was 41. On the morning of either September 1st or 2nd, Dorian went out to use his bulldozer to do some work at a rest home in nearby Holly Ridge in connection with a job that he was doing with a man named James David Brock:

**[2:56] Colin Miller:**

How do you learn that he's in this accident?

**Pam Lanier:**

He comes home, and he can't get out of the truck. And then, when he finally does get out of the truck, he's limpin' and he's draggin' that leg some. And I went runnin' to the door.

**Colin Miller:**

How does his leg look?

**Pam Lanier:**

His leg is all like, well, it was bloody at the time. What had happened, he was sitting in the 'dozer seat, and where the gear shift is? A tree log, I mean, a tree come in, and pinned it up against him. And it hit him right in here, on this part of his leg. And it was- really was nasty lookin. So we cleaned it up, the best way we could, and I told him, I said, we need to go get you checked, and see if you're alright. He said, I'm gonna wait and see what it looks like tomorrow. Well, the next day, it was just black and blue, it was just- already turnin.' And we finally, I can't remember, exactly, but it was more than a day or two, I think, before I ever got him to go to the doctor. It was after the fact. It wasn't like, that day, or the next day, I think it was like 2 or 3 days after that, he finally, he went to the doctor.

**Colin Miller:**

And during those 2 or 3 days...

**Pam Lanier:**

'Cause it wasn't healing, and it was bothering him.

**Colin Miller:**

Right. During those 2 or 3 days, are you trying to convince him to go to the doctor?

**Pam Lanier:**

Yes.

**Colin Miller:**

And what's he saying?

**Pam Lanier:**

No.

**[4:06] Rabia Chaudry:** During those two to three days after the bulldozer accident, a couple of other significant things happened that had important ramifications for Pam's trial. First, Pam called James David Brock. Here's the pertinent part of Brock's testimony at trial:

*Pam called me after he was hurt and in fact, Dorian called me wanting to go to finish the job. We were doing a rest home in Hollow Ridge, and I told him if I got a chance, I would, but I know I didn't have time to. But Pam called me, and wanted me to go talk with him. Said that Dorian was sick. Said he needed to go to the doctor.*

Brock would then clarify that:

*Pam called me and said, "James, Dorian is sick. He needs to go to the doctor." She said, "He'll listen to you. Come here, and talk to him."*

But then, when Brock did stop by the Lanier house the next evening, Pam's son Dustin told him that his mom and dad weren't home. Both Brock and his wife Doris would testify at trial that Pam later admitted to them that she had told her son to lie because "Dorian was not up to having company that day."

In isolation, this might not seem significant, but, at trial, the prosecution connected it up with the testimony of a woman named Alli Bradshaw, which takes us to the second significant event in the days after Dorian's bulldozer accident.

**Colin Miller:**

And, at some point, Alli Bradshaw? ...

**Pam Lanier:**

Yes.

**Colin Miller:**

Comes to stay with you? What are the circumstances of her...

**Pam Lanier:**

Her husband kicked her out. He beat her, and kicked her out. And I knew her, and Dorian knew her from school.

**Susan Simpson:** This was to be a mutually beneficial relationship. After her husband had kicked her out, Alli didn't have a place to stay, and Pam needed help with her daughter Kayla, as well as with Dorian, after his accident. At trial, Bradshaw would testify:

*Dorian had gotten hurt on the bulldozer, so Pam was, like, taking care of him, and she said, she just wanted me to help out with Kayla, you know? I was there to help Pam, and to really help with Kayla. Kayla was really upset about her daddy getting hurt because she really loved Dorian to death.*

**[6:00] Susan Simpson:** According to Bradshaw, this all happened in the days after Dorian's bulldozer accident. By the time of trial, for reasons we'll get into later, Bradshaw would end up testifying as a witness for the prosecution, and she would testify that there were times that Pam would prevent family and friends from seeing Dorian while he was ill. Importantly, though, Bradshaw never identified any specific people Pam prevented from seeing Dorian, and she in fact testified to several friends and family who DID visit Dorian during the two months that she lived with the Laniers.

So, the only example that jurors heard, in which Pam prevented others from seeing Dorian, was the incident described by James and Doris Brock. And you don't have to take our word for it, because in defending Pam's murder conviction on appeal, the State would only cite to the testimony by Bradshaw and the Brocks, on this point.

Instead, the thrust of the State's argument was that Pam failed to seek proper medical attention for Dorian in the months after his accident, which the State argued, was proof that she was poisoning him. So, to understand what they're trying to claim here, let's break this down into a few parts. First, was it clear that Dorian needed medical attention? Yes. He was definitely in need of that. This is one of two instances in which the *Deadly Women* episode about Pam's case is actually accurate:

***Deadly Women* Audio:**

**Male:**

It wasn't long, within weeks of the accident, I saw Dorian basically in an incapacitated state, almost in a stupor.

**Actress playing Pam Lanier:**

"Rest, my sweet."

**Female:**

Dorian was described by others as being a zombie.

**[7:28] Susan Simpson:** And, that takes us to the second point, which is that Dorian's condition wasn't fixed over those two months. It had an ebb and a flow, he'd have good

days and bad days, and some days, he was worse than he was on others. Nearly every day, Pam's nephew Mitchell Sanders would come by the farm in the time between the bulldozer accident and Dorian's death, and here's what he had to say about Dorian during that time:

**Mitchell Sanders:**

Before that, it's just trying to help him. Some days he'd be OK, some days, he wouldn't. And, just trying to get things done that he couldn't do.

And here's what Pam had to say about her husband's condition after the bulldozer accident:

**Pam Lanier:**

Dorian would be fine today, alright? Maybe tomorrow, he wouldn't. Mom and Dad come over- this was when I really started noticing a lot of weird stuff. Mom and Dad come over one night with a pie. A chocolate pie, which is my favorite. And she asked him, did he want some, and he said, "Yeah," and she cut it, and then he spit it back out on the plate! And, he just don't do things like that. He started actin'... then he started having like speech, like slur of his speech sometimes? Just things that didn't add up. And then, you could be talking to him later, and he would be totally talking to you normal. Or, then he would flip back to the slur, or not acting like he was thinking rationally.

**[10:56] Colin Miller:** In particular, there were two extended periods when Dorian left the turkey farm and seemed to be doing well after his bulldozer accident. The first was toward the beginning of October, when the Laniers went with their friends Tom and Page Hatcher to the Great Smoky Mountains and Dollywood. Here's Tom Hatcher:

**Tom Hatcher:**

Places like Dollywood and stuff around, and we had a good time, and he drove the whole time, he said, "Tom, do you mind if I drive us?" and I said, "You can drive! I'd rather ride than drive anyhow. He drove the majority of the time there, the only time he didn't really drive, and this is like the drinking part, [\*\*\*] by the bottle, he said, "Tom, do you mind if Page drives? That way, me and you can take a drink?" [Laughter] I said, "That's fine with me!" But, he done the majority of the driving, and some people said about it, later on, I said, that can't be the case. We just got back from the mountains *with* him.

**[11:46] Colin Miller:** Tom has a bit of a thick accent, so if you didn't catch all that, he's describing the trip they took to the Great Smoky Mountains and saying that Dorian was fine and even asked to drive except for the time when he wanted to drink.

And then, there was a trip to Myrtle Beach for Pam's birthday. This trip occurred from November 7th to 9th, or between 10 and 12 days before Dorian's death. They took the trip with Pam's parents and a friend named Evelyn Autry, and Autry says that, while Dorian wasn't 100%, he mostly seemed healthy and alert. On the 9th, the Laniers returned to Chinquapin and had a party for Pam's birthday, where multiple witnesses, including Autry, again said that Dorian was doing pretty well.

But then, the very next day, on November 10, Pam made a call to Eastern Digestive Disease Center, saying that Dorian was complaining of severe abdominal pain, headaches, dizzy spells and nausea. And this takes us to our third point, which is that, between Dorian's accident and his death, Pam did take Dorian to the doctor....*six times* between his first appointment after his accident and his death, despite Dorian's reluctance:

**Pam Lanier:**

That was the thing that, Doug kept telling me over and over. They want you to sign this plea, because you should've forced him to go. I said, "I got him there 6 times. If he says no, what am I supposed to do with him? Hold a gun to his head and put him in the vehicle?" I said, "It don't work that way. You can't make a grown man do something that he does not want to do."

**[13:18] Rabia Chaudry:** So, let's plot those visits. Again, Dorian was injured on September 1st or 2nd, and Pam took him to a doctor in Jacksonville, North Carolina a few days later. Then, on Sunday, September 14th, Pam took Dorian to Dr. Jordan at Onslow Doctors Care. The records show that that Dorian had bruising on his leg and possibly a mild infection. Dr. Jordan prescribed Dorian an antibiotic and a muscle relaxer.

During the week, Pam called Onslow Doctors Care and said that Dorian was "taking too much medication and running a fever." She scheduled an appointment for Dorian on Sunday, September 21st. At that appointment, Dorian had clogged ears, chest congestion, coughing, and leg pain. He said that he stopped taking his antibiotic after the first three pills. A urinalysis reveals that he'd been taking pain medications and sedatives that he hasn't been prescribed. The doctor once again prescribed the antibiotic and Advil as needed.

Six days later, on Saturday September 27th, Pam took Dorian back to see Dr. Jordan at Onslow Doctors Care. Dr. Jordan said that Dorian was ataxic, in other words he had difficulty walking, had slurred speech and was “completely out of it.” Pam told a nurse that Dorian was trying to self-cure with Darvocet, and the nurse noted that Dorian was unable to walk without assistance.

After this doctor’s visit, Pam and others said that Dorian started to do better. As we’ve already noted, Tom Hatcher said that his wife and he went with the Laniers to the Great Smoky Mountains in early October and Dorian seemed fine. And then, as we noted, there was the trip to Myrtle Beach from November 7th to 9th, during which Dorian again seemed to be doing relatively well.

But then, Pam made the call to Eastern Digestive the next day, saying that Dorian was in pain and nauseous. They couldn’t schedule an appointment until November 13th, so Pam took Dorian to Urgent Care in Surf City on November 11th, where Dorian saw Dr. W.N. Young. An interview with Dr. Young indicates that Pam “asked Dr. Young how she could have her husband stop taking turkey wormer,” a medication used to treat parasitic worm infections in turkeys.

Dr. Young diagnosed Dorian with diverticulitis, or infected pouches in his digestive tract. Otherwise, Dr. Young described Dorian’s appearance as normal and said that he walked in without assistance. Dr. Young prescribed a high roughage diet of Kellogg’s All Bran Buds, Metamucil, and Citrucel. He also prescribed Phenergan for motion sickness. The doctor’s notes indicated that Pam could give Dorian Phenergan injections if he was in too much pain to inject himself.

**[15:26] Susan Simpson:** Two days later, Pam and her father took Dorian to Eastern Digestive to see Dr. Kurt Vernon for his November 13th appointment. According to Dr. Vernon’s notes from that visit, Dorian described no change in his ability to remember things and no weakness or loss of motor strength. The notes also state that Dorian’s skin color was normal. But Dr. Vernon was concerned about Dorian’s condition, listing pancreatic malignancy, colitis, alcoholism, and lymphoma as potential problems.

The notes also indicate that Pam told a nurse that Dorian had taken some old medications from the family medicine cabinet and given himself a shot for cows, with

Pam showing the nurse the syringe he used to do it. The notes also say that Pam asked the nurse not to tell Dorian that she said this because he would get mad at her.

At the end of the appointment, Dr. Vernon scheduled a CT scan for the next day and a colonoscopy for November 17th. Colin talked with Pam's father Whitey about his recollection of this doctor's appointment and Dorian's willingness to see doctors after his accident:

**[16:24] Colin Miller:**

And was it your understanding that Dorian didn't want to see the doctor after the bulldozer accident?

**Whitey Sanders:**

Yeah, he didn't want to see the doctor after. I took him to a doctor myself, one time, before this happened. And the doctor wanted, the doctor told him "I need you at the hospital," and he wouldn't go to the hospital.

**Colin Miller:**

And why do you think he didn't want to go to see doctors?

**Whitey Sanders:**

I don't know, he just didn't like doctors, he wanted to go back home and work while he could. He was a working man.

So, The next day, November 14th, Dorian was a no show for a CT scan. According to the nurse's notes, "patient notified and refused."

**[17:10] Colin Miller:** Later, Dorian did appear for a preparation visit for his colonoscopy on November 16th. The notes from that visit indicate that Dorian had fever, chills, nausea, and vomiting. Dorian was referred to the ER, and showed up, but left before he was treated. According to Pam, Dorian got sick of waiting and left.

And then, we have the sixth and final doctor's visit. The next day, November 17th, Pam took Dorian back to see Dr. Jordan at Onslow Medical Care two days before his death. According to the notes from that visit, Dorian complained of nausea, diarrhea, body aches, fever, and vomiting. That said, Dr. Jordan thought that Dorian seemed to be doing okay and made no notes about Dorian's skin color being odd. In fact, Dr. Jordan's notes indicate that Dorian looked better than when Dr. Jordan last saw him on

September 27th. But Dr. Jordan did diagnose Dorian with gastroenteritis, or an inflammation of the stomach and intestines, and prescribed Phenergan and Cipro.

The following day, November 18th, Pam called Eastern Digestive and said that Dorian was unable to take the prep drink for the colonoscopy because it made him sick; she also said that she was giving him Phenergan and Pedialyte. And then, finally, we have November 19th, the day that Dorian died.

Without getting into too much detail about that day just yet, we have one last set of notes from the nurse at Eastern Digestive. It notes that she received a call from the Laniers and that Dorian couldn't control himself. According to the notes "He states he is taking Phenergan and it is not helping. I advised patient to proceed to ER and he refused 'would wait it out.' Patient encouraged to go but refused."

**[19:13] Susan Simpson:** That takes us to our fourth point, which we've already touched upon, with clips from both Pam and her father Whitey: After his accident, Dorian did not want to go to the doctor. This is the second instance in which the *Deadly Women* episode was accurate...in its own way:

**[19:29] Female Narrator:**

It's only a minor injury. But Dorian needs constant attention. He doesn't trust doctors, preferring his wife to take charge.

Now this is something that's not really open to reasonable dispute: Every witness for the prosecution and the defense all testified that Dorian had an aversion to doctors and indicated that it was tough to get him to change his mind. For instance, here's Mitchell Sanders:

**[19:57] Mitchell Sanders:**

[garbled]..saying Dorian, you need to go to the doctor, and he had slurred speech, and you couldn't understand him sayin' nothin. But he didn't want to go.

And here's Mitchell's mother Lisa Padgett, who would talk to both her son and Dorian after the accident:

**[20:12] Lisa Padgett:**

Well, he would tell me that, you know, well Dorian's had a rough week, or he's not feeling good, or something, you know. Then my son called me one day, one of the last times I talked to Dorian, Mitchell called me and said "Mom, Dorian's

not doin' good, but we can't get him to go to the doctor." And I said, "Have you all told him to go?" and he said "Yeah, we've all tried to get him to go to the doctor." He said "but he won't go." Anyhow the next time I talked to Dorian I told him "Mitchell said that you're not feelin' good, or that you're real sick and that you need to go to the doctor." And he said "I don't need to go to a doctor." He said he was a private person. He wouldn't tell you if he'd been to a doctor *that day*. He wouldn't tell you.

And when Colin visited with Pam in prison, she relayed a conversation she'd recently had with her case manager on the subject:

**[21:03] Pam Lanier:**

He said, "Miss Lanier, are you sorry for the crime you committed?" He said, "Do you have any remorse?" I said, "No". He said, "Do you know what you just told me?" I said, "Yes, I know what I just told you. I said no." He said, "How can you say no to the remorse?" He said, "I see you, coming in and out of classifications all the time, and the responsibility they've put on you," he said, "and you're telling me no." I said, "Mr. Ogden, I don't want to go in my business with you," I said, "but I'm trying to fight now for my innocence." And I said, "I did not do it. So no I don't have any remorse. The only remorse I have is that I didn't maybe throw him across my shoulder and take him and throw him in the car and take him to the doctor." I said, "That's the only remorse I have." And he looked at me, and he said "It just don't sound like you." And I know it sounded cold, but it's the truth. I don't have no remorse 'cause I did what I could do on my part. What part he would let me. Yeah, now I wish I hadda about knocked him in the head and thrown him across my shoulders and took him there, and made him stay, you know. But I done the best I could.

And finally, that gets us to our fifth point, which we've also touched upon a bit, here's Pam's mother Shirley:

**[22:26] Colin Miller:**

And what was your sense about Dorian and seeing doctors, and whether he wanted to see doctors or not after his accident?

**Shirley Sanders:**

He didn't feel he needed a doctor. He figured that the farm stuff would take care of him. He said "That's what I've always done, and it'll take care of me.

Several witnesses would testify about Dorian self-medicating through traditional and non-traditional means. For Here's Mitchell Sanders talking about Dorian's medication habits

**[22:53] Mitchell Sanders:**

I remember he'd be about passed out or somethin', he'd have pills in his pocket, and I don't know where they come from, or he was on the floor, I don't know where he's gettin' the pills from. I know he made the comment that the same medication that he'd give his cows... I didn't see him give himself a shot, but they said he gave himself a shot with the same type of needle, the great big needle that he'd give the cows that he had. He said if it would cure the cows it could cure him.

Before, we discussed how Dorian's condition would ebb and flow, and most of those ebbs seemed to coincide with a particular type of self-medication. Here's Pam's father Whitey:

**[23:38] Whitey Sanders:**

He was good until he got hurt. When he went down to the turkey house and came back, he wasn't the same man. He'd drink the water right there at the turkey house.

**Colin Miller:**

So he told you that he used to drink out of the water that he would use to give the turkey medication to the turkeys?

**Whitey Sanders:**

Yeah, take a swig, out of the spigot what goes there. I seen him drink that.

**Colin Miller:**

Oh you actually saw him drinking out of that system.

**Whitey Sanders:**

Out of the spigot water fountain that runs the water right there.

**[24:14] Rabia Chaudry:** Whitey is referencing a medication that Dorian would give the turkeys to promote weight gain and turn their skin pink. It's name was 3-Nitro or Roxarsone, and Dorian had a medication system set up at the farm where he would dilute packets of 3-Nitro into water and deliver it to the turkeys through a hose. The

hose had a bypass valve that would allow you to drink fresh water, but several witness say that, after the accident, Dorian would drink a yellowish water out of the hose without using the bypass valve. One of those witnesses was Mitchell Sanders, and another was Pam's mother Shirley:

**[24:43] Shirley Sanders:**

We went up there one Saturday, my friend and I did, and uh, Dustin came runnin' in and said "Dorian's drinking out of that turkey hose", and of course I went out there, but uh, he still drunk out of it. Now what was in it, I could not tell you.

**Colin Miller:**

Right.

**[24:43] Shirley Sanders:**

But they said that he was not supposed to be drinking out of it.

But while Shirley didn't know what was in the hose, Pam says that Dorian knew full well that he wasn't supposed to be drinking out of it:

**[25:11] Pam Lanier:**

He would always tell us "Do not to wash the car, or the trucks, when I have the medicator going. Do not. And do not let nobody drink out of the hoses when the turkey medicator was going. But yet he would go out there and pick it up and drink out of it sometimes. And I would say to him "Well you got turkey medicator...did you not just tell me that earlier today, not to do...? "Yes but it's not that much, just a little bit, it's not hurtin' me", he said "I just need some fresh water." He would come up with these different reasons why he would have to do things like that.

**[25:48] Rabia Chaudry:** This provides a good transition to the third piece of evidence against Pam at trial, with the first two pieces again being the drowning of Johnny Ray and the fire at the Ludie Brown house. This third piece of evidence was the testimony of Alli Bradshaw. As we already noted, she testified about Pam preventing people from seeing Dorian when he was sick, with the only corroboration being the testimony by James and Doris Brock about what happened in early September.

Bradshaw testified that there was a three day period toward the end of September when Dorian was zonked out with "swollen phlegm coming out of his mouth." According to Bradshaw, Dorian would just lay there in bed, and Pam and she had to physically move

him to try to sit up. At one point, they put plastic under Dorian in the bed because he was defecating on himself.

With regard to those three days, Bradshaw would testify as follows:

**[26:38] Colin reads questions and Susan reads answers in the following:**

**Q:** Did you see the defendant feed him anything during that time period?

**A:** No sir. Well, I'll say about the third day I kept telling pam this man is going to die if he doesn't get something to eat, get some help from somewhere, and we did get -- she took ice cream and put it on her finger and would stick it in his mouth trying to get him to eat.

**Q:** Okay. You've said several times you told the defendant that he needed -- she needed to take him to the hospital, she needed to get the defendant -- the victim, to the hospital. Her response to you would be what?

**A:** He's not going to the hospital. He doesn't want to go to the hospital. And I told her -- we had him sitting up one day and I said, "Pam, we've got to get this man to the hospital," and Dorian was -- she was behind him with him sitting up and he -- all he could do was mumble and it was, "Wom, wom, wom."

Bradshaw would go on to testify about an event around this same time when Dorian fell out of his truck and was on the ground, completely out of of it, having defecated himself. Bradshaw testified that Tammy Brown, the wife of Dorian's nephew, got a camcorder and filmed Dorian. The prosecution was able to get the video, but not the audio, of the recording admitted as demonstrative evidence to show what Bradshaw saw. So now, as listeners, you're going to have the opposite experience, hearing but not seeing what Tammy recorded:

**[27:52] Alli Bradshaw:**

Don't video me. My god. Show 'em his stinkin' drawers out here, he shit in his drawers. Layin' over there too. He just says leave him alone.

**Pam Lanier:**

I don't need to see him laying out here like this Tammy.

**Alli Bradshaw:**

Tammy, don't you think she should go on to the magistrate's office and put him somewhere where he can get well? Now he's been a month.

**Tammy Brown:**

I would.

**Pam Lanier:**

I'm going to call them as soon as we get him in the house, I can't afford that, I just cannot...

**Alli Bradshaw:**

Can you pull him?

**Pam Lanier:**

Hell yeah, I'll pull him, give him rug burn, hell it's better than the damn mess hanging out there in the kitchen all day, the damn flies...

He's asleep right now. I ain't got the whole...in there....

**[28:37] Rabia Chaudry:** The prosecution introduced this video to show that Pam was callous to Dorian's suffering and either reckless or malicious in failing to get him medical attention, again to support their theory that Pam was poisoning him. Colin asked Pam about the making of this video, and here was her response:

**[28:52] Pam Lanier:**

Tammy wanted him videoed, he was fine. He was fine that day, fine. He goes to the turkey houses, he locks me and Tammy up in the turkey house! (laughs). I don't know why he done that. He locked us up in there and we were tryin' to get out and then when he finally let us out and he was puttin' medication, I will tell you that, he was puttin' medication in the turkey house that day. When he did let us out he started actin' funny. And we were, I mean we were both frustrated. I was so mad (laughs), it was hot, I mean I'm gon' be honest, it was hot in them turkey houses, and here I was locked up in that turkey house, and so we got home and he fell out of the truck and he wouldn't get up. And I started fussin' at him and told him, you know, I'm tired of it, you know, you gotta stop this. I said a few choice Sunday school words to him, I'm gon' be honest with you. And she says, I want him to see himself like this when he's actin' like this. She says I'm gonna go home and grab the camcorder. So she come back and she videoed it. I

did not ask her to do that, I didn't even bring it up because I hadn't even thought about somethin' like that, and she did. She took it home with her, that night she showed it to Matt, then she gave it back to us and I showed it to Dorian the next day. And he was in good mind that day. I mean, good mind when he seen that. And it upset him that he was actin' like that. I said, but not enough to get some help. I said, you know, you're gonna do this, then you need help. There's somethin' wrong, you don't act like this.

**Colin Miller:** No one has an exact date for this video, but it seems like there are two options. Either it was made right before Pam did take Dorian to the doctor on September 27th, or it was soon after this doctor's visit and just before the Laniers took the trip with Tom and Page Hatcher, with Tom again saying that Dorian was doing well.

Nonetheless, Bradshaw's testimony was damaging, even if her testimony wasn't much different from the defense witnesses who said that Dorian refused to go to the doctor. And that's because she was there every day and testifying that Pam wasn't taking Dorian to the doctor despite his obvious distress.

So, what happened to turn Alli Bradshaw against Pam Lanier? Well, one possibility comes from Bradshaw herself. When Pam heard that Bradshaw was making statements against her to the police, she decided to record a phone call with her former friend:

**[30:55] Colin Miller:**

Do you remember the circumstances of that phone call that you had with her that was recorded?

**Pam Lanier:**

I recorded it I think, wasn't it? Wasn't it me that recorded it? I think I did. I recorded that phone call. Because you know, they told me that she was sayin' that I did not and you come, he died in November, you come to my house, and my parents were there in January, and sayin' that they were questioning you about it...

Now, unfortunately, the audio of that call has been lost to the years, but we do have a transcript of the call. Here's the pertinent portion, with Susan saying the lines for Pam Lanier, and Rabia saying the lines for Allie Bradshaw:

**Lanier:**

Well, listen, can I ask you one thing?

**Bradshaw:**

Uh-huh.

**Lanier:**

Did you not think I did everything I could for Doran [sic] when you were living here?

**Bradshaw:**

The only thing that I could say negative is that I think we should have carried him to the doctor.

**Lanier:**

Well, he wouldn't go.

**Bradshaw:**

I mean that's the only negative thing I can say, Pam.

**Lanier:**

You can't take one when they won't go though.

**Bradshaw:**

But it was like those days that we rolled him and tumbled him on that bed, you know, and I really thought he was going to get pneumonia and die then.

**Lanier:**

Boy, he was sick that day.

**Bradshaw:**

He was so sick... That's the only negative thing I can say, is that we should have got him to the hospital. That's the only thing I can say.

**Lanier:**

But the rest of it...

**Bradshaw:**

I mean, if he had been my husband, he would have gone.

**Lanier:**

Well, I mean I would have took him if he would have agreed to it then, and even after you went back to school in October, I mean he let us take him three times after that, but it was like a fight to get him there and a fight to get him back. I mean he showed his butt every time we went.

**Bradshaw:**

That's the only thing that I can say.

**Lanier:**

But you don't feel that I neglected him in no way?

**Bradshaw:**

No.

**Lanier:**

Thank you, because I have heard so many stories that you thought I was killing him here. I said, that don't sound like Alley [sic].

**Bradshaw:**

No. You know good and well I ain't said no such thing.

**Lanier:**

I said Alley [sic] has... I mean I...

**Bradshaw:**

They're trying to say that I helped kill him, you know.

**Colin Miller:** Now, this call isn't drastically different from Bradshaw's testimony at trial, but it does clarify that her complaint about Pam's behavior was only with regard to those three days when Dorian was bed-ridden. It's really the accusatory tone of Bradshaw's trial testimony that probably hurt Pam, and, based on this call, you might see why. According to Bradshaw herself, law enforcement was saying that she helped Pam kill Dorian, so it's easy to see how this could lead to Bradshaw shifting blame off of herself and onto Pam.

And then, there's the second possibility. The notes from Bradshaw's police interview indicate that she gave it while her husband was present. Yes, the same husband who had abused her and kicked her out before Pam and Dorian took her in. It's impossible to

ascertain how this bore upon what Bradshaw had to say about what happened to Dorian, but it's easy to imagine the effect not being good for Pam.

Now, we noted before that Bradshaw testified that Pam kept Dorian from seeing people while he was sick. But she also identified the following people as having come to visit Dorian when he was sick, some of them multiple times: both of Pam's parents, Dorian's father, Matt and Tammy Brown, Durwood and Vivian Parker, the man who purchased Dorian's sister's house, and Lowell Sloan. And that's not even including Mitchell Sanders, who was at the house almost every day, and other people we've mentioned such as Tom and Page Hatcher and Evelyn Autry. And all of these witnesses gave good or at least neutral testimony about Pam trying to get Dorian to see a doctor and/or Dorian being reluctant to see a doctor.

**[34:28] Susan Simpson:** That leaves one final person mentioned by Alli Bradshaw and the fourth piece of evidence against Pam Lanier at her trial. That final person was Dorian's friend, Jackie Hatcher. This takes us back to November 19, 1997, the day Dorian died. According to Jackie Hatcher's testimony at trial, at some point that day, Jackie saw Dorian driving his truck and had a conversation with him, with Dorian seeming to be in good shape. Hatcher did not testify that Dorian's skin looked odd at this point.

Then, at some point later that day on the 19th, John Lockerman came to the Lanier residence. Lockerman was the person who delivered the turkey medication to the Laniers, and Pam remembers his visit on November 19th:

**[35:07] Pam Lanier:**

I remember the day he died he was yellow. I can tell you that.

**Colin Miller:**

Was he yellow before that at all?

**Pam Lanier:**

No, nothin' like that. I ain't never seen anything... when I tell you he was as yella as that sign over there, the yella, the yellow ones, he was that yella. His pupils and his eyes was even that yella.

**Colin Miller:**

And when did you first see him and he looked yellow on that day?

**Pam Lanier:**

Um... God you're asking me all the questions (laughs)... Do I need a time limit? I don't remember if it was mornin', or, I don't remember. I know the turkey man come that day, I think it was that same day, 'cause you know, he, he was talkin' 'bout how good he talked, but he said he does have some jaundice, I said he does. I said, you know, I said I'm tryin' to get him now to let's go get it checked out. And he had told Dorian, he had talked to Dorian, Dorian was talkin' very well that day, very well. And um... but I told him later, I said Dorian, I said you're gettin' yellower and yellower, I said what is wrong, I said why are you like that, I said you need to go get, I said even your eyeballs now is turnin'. I know that. He said just give me a lil bit of time, let's see what happens. He said if it don't clear up in a little bit, I'll go. He said, I promise I'll go this time.

**Colin Miller:**

And the turkey guy coming, is he picking turkeys up or is he delivering medication?

**Pam Lanier:**

No, he's delivering medication.

**Colin Miller:**

Okay. Do you know whether Dorian mixed a barrel of 3-Nitro and water that day?

**Pam Lanier:**

I know he went out to the turkey houses, but 100% I can't tell you yes or no. I can't tell you that, 'cause I don't know. But I know that he bought medication.

**[36:48] Susan Simpson:** Pam's memory lines up with John Lockerman's testimony. He testified that he did come to the Lanier residence on November 19th and that, when he interacted with Dorian, he looked yellow but his mind seemed to be working okay and he could communicate with him. Lockerman's testimony also makes it seem likely that Dorian mixed the turkey medication that same day because Lockerman testified that after you mixed the medication with water, it would be "[g]one within a day's time, one flock of turkeys would...drink it all in one day." So when Pam was later charged with murder, her defense team went to the farm and they "found a barrel of the solution that Mr. Lanier had mixed prior to his death," which is presumably the same barrel he mixed the on the day he died and had not yet been depleted, so its contents were still there.

**Colin Miller:** Returning back to November 19th, as we noted before, at some point, the Laniers called Eastern Digestive, with a nurse telling Dorian to go the ER and Dorian refusing and saying that he “would wait it out.” I asked Pam to fill in the blanks for the rest of the day:

**[37:50] Pam Lanier:**

He didn't act out of the ordinary, except his skin color was bad. And his eyes was beginnin' to turn yellow.

**Colin Miller:**

Okay. And so then what happened throughout the rest of the day?

**Pam Lanier:**

He went and laid down, and Dustin and Mitchell went to the back of the farm, and me and Kayla was in the house with him, and um, Jackie come up, and I told him that he was restin', I said come on in, I said he's restin', and he said “Well I just come to check on him to see how he was doin'.” While he was talkin' to me Dorian come out of the room and come in there and said “Hey buddy” and then that's when his legs started collapsin', and that's when I called 911.

**Colin Miller:**

Okay.

**[38:29] Rabia Chaudry:** Jackie Hatcher's testimony doesn't differ too much from Pam's memory. He testified about coming to the Lanier house, noting that Dorian had yellow-orange skin, seeing him walking around like a zombie, and having the seizure that Pam described. In his testimony, Jackie also said that Pam was preparing a Pedialyte drink for Dorian and checking his blood pressure. Pam and Jackie only differ on the impetus for the 911 call. Pam says she made the decision to call 911 while Jackie says that he told Pam that Dorian was going to die and that she needed to call 911.

As with Alli Bradshaw, there's nothing overtly incriminatory about Jackie Hatcher's testimony against Pam, but it's the tone of his testimony that's important. Jackie clearly seems to be saying that Pam should have sought help for Dorian before he arrived; he he also seems to be implying that Pam might have been poisoning Dorian when she was making his Pedialyte drink. So, why does Pam think that Jackie turned on her?

**[39:22] Pam Lanier:**

Jackie and his um... nephew, Robbie Hatcher, which was on the sheriff department at the time, tried to come buy the farm from me after Dorian died. And they offered me, Daddy could tell you more I think on that one, I'm tryin' to say probably... twenty, thirty, forty thousand less than what Doug did when I was gonna sell it to him.

**Colin Miller:**

And is that what you think turned Jackie against you?

**Pam Lanier:**

Mhm.

**Colin Miller:**

Was that you were going to sell to Doug?

**Pam Lanier:**

'Cause he was sure up there tryin' to get that farm from me, really hard.

As with Alli Bradshaw, there's some support for the claim that Jackie Hatcher shaded his testimony against Pam. For instance, at trial, the defense called a man named Greg Sanders, who testified that, soon after Dorian's death,

**Colin Miller:**

Jackie told me standing outside the door that him and Pam both had tried to get Dorian to go to the doctor and he wouldn't go and that Dorian had even cussed at him before when he was trying to get him to go.

**Rabia Chaudry:** Returning to the night of November 19th, whether it was Pam or Jackie's idea, Pam called 911, and the husband and wife EMT team of Pam and Harold Hatcher arrived at the Lanier residence at around 6:00 P.M.

Harold Hatcher wasn't too surprised by the call because he knew about Dorian's proclivities:

**[40:34] Harold Hatcher**

So, somebody opened up... oldest one told me, said that Dorian had an accident on the bulldozer and messed it - had a bad scar on his leg. He's always said he

wouldn't go to doctors, everybody knows, and so... and I told, and I said that-- that he would say, if the medicine was good enough for animals, it was good enough for him.

This then informed what Harold did when he arrived at the Lanier residence:

**[40:55] Harold Hatcher:**

So, that's when we got the ambulance call, and I told... whatever she said, Dorian-- I said, "Pam... let me, let me go in first 'cause Dorian's been doin' somethin' crazy." So I told her [undecipherable], and I walked in next door, and I said he was alarmingly yellow., He said... he said, "Harold, I don't feel too good." I said, "Dorian, you don't look too good," and he didn't. He was really, alarmingly yellow, and so I didn't even check him, I went and took his wife inside, I said, "Pam, what has he been takin'?" She said, "Nothin' I know of." So, then I come back and, and they always said about Dorian didn't like to go to hospital, and I said, "Dorian- for the sake of your family, your youngest and everyone, we gotta go to the hospital." He's like, "Alright, Harold, I'll go." So, we took off to the hospital, and on the way we're talkin', jokin'. He says, "Harold, I've done some stupid things in my life," I said, "We all have!" And, it didn't dawn on me, because we were talkin' just as good right here. I didn't, do it like he was on the deathbed. He was still coherent, talkin'... and all that other junk?? About, he was out of it, and this here... Dorian was very coherent.

The records show that Dorian arrived at the emergency room at 6:25 P.M. According to a number of witnesses, Dorian remained pretty coherent for the next four hours. As we already reported at the start at episode one, Pam Hatcher, the other EMT, testified that Dorian said he had done this to himself and that he wouldn't have made it this far without his wife. Pam Lanier's father Whitey remembers something similar; he testified that Dorian told him, "I messed myself up" and "What's done I've done to myself." When Colin talked to Whitey, he went into more detail about his recollection of the night that Dorian died:

**[42:31] Whitey Sanders:**

I went to the hospital bed, and he was there. And I had, I had been in there and prayed with him 'bout ten minutes before it happened. Ten or fifteen minutes. And I was standing right outside, by the door, when he passed away, doctor went in there and done something, water come out and everything, and he passed on away. I was right there.

**Colin Miller:**

And did you talk to Dorian at the hospital?

**Whitey:**

Talk to him what?

**Colin Miller:**

Did you talk to him when he was at the hospital?

**Whitey:**

I sure did. Doctor wanted him to stay there that night and I told him if he didn't want to stay, And I told him- if you stay here with them, I'll stay here with you. And I didn't hear no more, and the nurse come in and said the doctor wants to come in and see you, and I left out, and the doctor went in there and a couple of seconds, the water and stuff hit the floor and I knew somethin' was wrong, right then. He had somethin' busted in him.

**[43:42] Colin Miller:** This is a common thread among everyone we've talked to about this case. Everyone says that Dorian was coherent and even wanted to leave the ER before the doctor performed a rectal exam at about 10:30 P.M. They all seem convinced that something went wrong with this rectal exam, causing Dorian's death at 10:57 P.M.

It's an interesting theory, but it's one I haven't really pursued...because Dorian did have lethal levels of arsenic in his system and his causes of death are listed as renal failure, liver failure, and cardiorespiratory arrest, all of which are consistent with arsenic poisoning. Besides, proving that Dorian's arsenic levels weren't the cause of his death would seem to be a bit of a Pyrrhic victory, because it wouldn't really undermine the State's claim that Pam was poisoning Dorian.

And, in terms of that claim, the State had a fifth and final piece of evidence against Pam: that, over a 4 year period, from early 1994 to early 1998, Pam had purchased over \$10,000 in medication. That's is because, essentially right after Pam met Dorian, she started suffering from a series of medical conditions. Constant headaches, skin lesions, and shingles. According to Mitchell Sanders, it was this last condition that had the biggest effect on Pam being able to take care of Dorian:

**[44:51] Mitchell Sanders:**

She had the shingles real bad and she had a hard enough time taking care of herself.

And here's Pam's own recollection of her physical condition at the time:

**[45:00] Colin Miller:**

And what exactly were you going through at that time?

**Pam Lanier:**

I was takin' Nubain and Phenergan, and I had... one daughter says I didn't [laughing]... I don't know what I had anymore [laughing], but I had some shingles. And, um, I was...they gave me the medication for pain. And they let me inject my own self! And, um, that was a big issue. They said that I wasn't thinkin' rationally. Well, I drove. I done everything else. I mean, I was doing rationally, because it wasn't affecting me in no way like that.

**Colin Miller:**

Right.

**Pam Lanier:**

I mean, I could drive my vehicles. I could go to work. I didn't miss no work. I didn't do none of that stuff. But I will say this -- when the turkey houses was...the turkeys were gone and the turkey houses was cleaned out, everything else...I didn't have headaches or nothin', I mean *nothin'* anymore. Everything went away and then I, ya know, somebody told me one time they thought it was the mon -- the pneumonia [sic] from that smells and stuff that that might have caused the problem. But, everything started going away and I didn't have no more problems.

**Colin Miller:**

Would you say that you became addicted to the medications?

**Pam Lanier:**

Yes. I did for a few months and then when I put it down, I was... 'cause seeing myself goin' from one shot a day, to two shots a day, and actually I even took three sometime, and yes I did.

According to the State, Pam was manipulating the system and seeing multiple doctors to get more prescription meds, and they tried to used this manipulation to try to buttress

the black widow archetype they were pushing and also to argue that Pam might have killed Dorian to get insurance money and fuel her addiction.

**[46:39] Susan Simpson:** And so, that was the case against Pam Lanier: Johnny Ray's drowning, the Ludie Brown fire, Alli Bradshaw's testimony, Jackie Hatcher's testimony, and the evidence connected to Pam's own medical conditions and drug use. By itself, this evidence doesn't sound very impressive, but...Pam was Dorian's primary caretaker, and he died from chronic and acute arsenic poisoning. So, once you eliminate the impossible, you're left with the result that Pam must have poisoned Dorian.

Now, of course though, we've previewed the main other possibility for Dorian's death throughout this episode: that Dorian poisoned himself, specifically through his ingestion of the turkey medication. Why does 3-Nitro turn turkey meat into a pleasing pink color? Because it contains arsenic. That arsenic is primarily organic in form, meaning it's arsenic that's bonded with carbon, but it also contains arsenic in partially inorganic form, meaning arsenic in its pure metallic form.

So, of course, Pam's defense attorneys sought out expert opinions about whether ingesting this turkey medication, this 3-Nitro, could have caused the arsenic poisoning that Dorian died from. But they didn't like the responses they were getting. Defense counsel consulted with Dr. Page Hudson, who had worked on about 50 arsenic cases. Dr. Hudson told them that 3-Nitro had mostly organic arsenic and that "[o]rganic arsenic does not have much of an edge to it - in other words, less kick - than inorganic arsenic does." Pam's attorney, W. Douglas Parsons, had Dr. Hudson do some testing on the 3-Nitro, and Parsons later prepared the following memo for Pam's file:

*Dr. Hudson called WDP this afternoon and informed the WDP that he had done some preliminary analysis based on the information which I discussed with him at our meeting of November 10, 2000. In Dr. Hudson's opinion with the 3-Nitro mixed in proper dilution (according to the instructions on the packet) that he thought it would be very difficult to ingest enough fluid to result in the levels which were presented in [Dorian] Lanier's body at autopsy. Dr. Hudson did express an opinion that if taken otherwise (such as with peanut butter or in iced tea) that there is enough inorganic arsenic contained in 3-Nitro to be significant (in other words to result in the levels which were found in [Dorian] Lanier).*

*Dr. Hudson prepared a letter to me with this information as well as some hard numbers he had computed, and I instructed Dr. Hudson that I would prefer he not*

*mail a letter, but to discuss it with Jack and I after he had completed all of his work and we had the results of any toxicologist's opinions. Dr. Hudson agreed/*

Dr. Hudson's letter is not in the defense file, so you can only imagine that the results were not favorable to the theory that Dorian died from the turkey water.

The defense also contacted a second arsenic expert, Dr. Alphonse Polkis, who's possibly the leading expert on arsenic poisoning in the country at the time. But there's also not a report by Dr. Polkis in the defense files. We do have notes from an interview of the defense counsel after trial, and those notes indicate that the defense council was asked whether Dorian's arsenic poisoning could have come from the turkey water. According to those notes, "Mr. Polkis stated that it was not in fact possible, something to do with the arsenic found in Dorian verse the type of arsenic in the turkey medicator." So, in the end, Dr. Polkis was not called at trial. And in an audio interview of trial counsel by a Wake Forest student, defense council went into more detail about this decision:

**[50:05] W. Douglas Parsons:**

For whatever reason, I don't think we used Polkis, and if we didn't then I know why. We didn't, that means that, uh, his testimony was, uh, harmful to us.

**Student:**

Yeah. So I guess, would you mind, sort of, with your conversation with Polkis -- was he really your main source for the arsenic poisoning and the fact that Dorian could not have gotten that amount of poisoning from the turkey medicine?

**W. Douglas Parsons:**

Yeah, he was. At the time that we found him, we did a lotta research on, uh, who we thought would be kind of the guru in this area, and Polkis was who we settled on.

**Student:**

Okay

**W. Douglas Parsons:**

He is, a -- I guess he's still living, I don't know, but Polkis is, uh, at that time was, uh, in our opinion the most knowledgeable man about this type, and he had done a lot of research, written a lot of articles on it, and so that's why we hired him.

**[51:10] Colin Miller:** So, then, how was it that the prosecution offered the extremely favorable plea bargains that we discussed last episode? Well, that takes us to the most famous line ever uttered by Paul Newman on the silver screen:

**Excerpt from *Cool Hand Luke*:**

**Dragline:**

Just like today, when he kept comin' back at me - with nothin'.

**Luke:**

Yeah, well, sometimes nothin' can be a real cool hand.

You see, while the defense had nothing, their apparent technique of not having their experts do reports meant that the State was in the dark. And that allowed the defense to pull off the ultimate bluff:

**[51:33] W. Douglas Parsons:**

Pam had told us that the, uh, turkey medicator, of which came in the form of water with a certain percentage of arsenic mixed in it. She had told us that Dorian, uh, frequently drank from that, during the, uh, heat of the summer, et cetera, et cetera, et cetera. And so... we took that and were running with it. And we slowed down very quickly, as far as that being our primary defense whenever we met with, uh, I believe it was Alphons[o] Polkis up in Richmond, maybe? And he told us it just, ya know, couldn't be the case, because we had the ingredients of the, uh, well in the actual mixture, as far as the percentage of arsenic, it was very small. But we ran that as a bluff, as far as a defense. We, uh, while maintaining our ethics, we absolutely, uh, ran a hard, um, impression that we had a valid defense, uh, regarding injection of, uh, turkey laced water.

**[52:45] Colin Miller:** But the defense couldn't bluff Pam, who maintained that she didn't kill Dorian and wouldn't take the plea deals. And the defense couldn't bluff the jury without an actual expert. On the other hand, at trial, prosecutor Dean Bowman asked John Lockerman whether he'd ever had another turkey grower using 3-Nitro die of

arsenic poisoning in his 20 years, he responded, “Not to my knowledge.” And, during closing arguments, Bowman made the claim to the jury that even drinking 250 gallons of water from the turkey medicator hose wouldn’t be enough to kill you. And so, after eliminating the impossible, the jury convicted Pam Lanier of murder.

But what if the State hadn’t really eliminated the impossible, and what if there were a way to prove Pam’s innocence and Dorian’s actual cause of death 17 years later:

**[53:32] Unknown Female:**

I would say, absent other information, this would seem to be the major cause.

**Colin Miller:**

Right...

**Unknown Female:**

I mean, when you see the liver failure and that the immediate cause of death was cardio-respiratory arrest, I mean that’s pretty telling.

“Arsenic and Old Lace,”...next time on Undisclosed...

**[54:36] Rabia Chaudry:** A big thank you to everybody who makes Undisclosed possible and has made this series possible. Thank you to our sponsors who help us put on our episodes week after week. Thank you to Mital Telhan, our executive producer, for helping keep this ship afloat. Thank you to Rebecca LaVoie, our fantastic audio producer and also the co-host and producer of a couple of my favorite podcasts, including Crime Writers On, do not miss her podcast. Thank you to Baluki for our logo, to Christy for maintaining our website. A big thank you to AC Parham for helping with research on the Pam Lanier series, and also Rebecca LaVoie will be hosting our Addendum, make sure to tag Rebecca in your questions, anything related to this case, use the hashtag #UDAddendum, and Rebecca LaVoie’s Twitter handle is @Reblavoie. Also a big thank you to our listeners. Thanks for coming back week after week. Check us out and make sure to follow us online on Twitter, Instagram and Facebook, our handle is @UndisclosedPod. And, please do not forget to subscribe to us on iTunes and rate us. Thanks so much. See you in a week.